

PIERS & HARBOURS -
MARINE ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1.1 This report provides Members with an update on the major and noteworthy projects and schemes currently being addressed within Argyll and Bute Council Marine Asset Plan.
- 1.2 Priorities continue to be informed with close liaison with Transport Scotland, CMAL and CalMac to ensure targeted and timely resources.
- 1.3 This report provides an update on the following projects:
- Caignure
 - Passenger Access at existing terminal
 - Public consultation – New Pier
 - Iona / Fionnphort
 - Rothesay
 - Piling and grouting works
 - pontoons
 - Dunoon / Kilcreggan
- 1.4 Members are asked to endorse this report and approve the Caignure Interim Option 1 (do minimal) at point 4.5.

MARINE ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN

2.0 INTRODUCTION

- 2.1 This report provides Members with an update on the major and noteworthy projects and schemes currently being addressed within Argyll and Bute Marine Asset Management Plan.

3.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 3.1 Members are asked to endorse this report and approve the Craignure Interim Option 1 (do minimal) at point 4.5.

4.0 DETAIL: The Asset Management Plan

- 4.1 Following are the details for the more notable projects in the Asset Management Plan to appraise the Members with their progress. Capital works programmed for the 2021 to 2022 financial year are valued at £10.335 million.

The Asset Management Plan remains under review subject to project deliverance, delays and adapting to changes in stakeholder priorities, however it remains on track and there is no requirement to alter the forecast to date. The Rothesay Pontoon Project issues may be the most likely source of significant slippage dependant on eventual start time.

- 4.2 The Asset Management Plan lists the works to be carried out on Argyll and Bute Council marine infrastructure over the next 10-year period.

4.3 Craignure – Passenger access at existing terminal

The existing Passenger Access System (PAS) at Craignure was out of service in February 2021 due to safety concerns and while the necessary risk assessments and modifications were completed. CMAL has been clear that the PAS is now close to the end of its operational lifespan and that the modifications are merely a stay regarding decommissioning. Royal Haskoning has been engaged to develop tender documentation and design specs for a compliant replacement PAS at the existing terminal location. This is at an early stage with CalMac to date providing an extensive list of potential in scope vessels. These vessels include short, long term and contingency options with the aim of maximising options as to the potential future use of the PAS when the Long-Term Option for Craignure has been completed.

4.4 Craignure – Public consultation – Existing Pier (Interim)

Due to the timescales associated with developing and constructing the Long Term replacement of the ferry terminal and pier, the Scottish Transport Guidance (STAG) study for Craignure published in 2019 included a number of Interim Options which could potentially bridge the gap between the present infrastructure and the future development. Argyll & Bute Council commissioned Mott MacDonald and Stantec to progress an Outline Business Case (OBC) to appraise which of these options should be recommended to Members.

4.5 Craignure - the Interim Options and risk comparisons

0. Do Nothing:

This is effectively a continuation of the status quo and there would be no works beyond the day-to-day maintenance.

Although there would be no major investment or sunken costs, this option would be hugely unpopular and politically unacceptable in Mull & Iona. Even with a tangible commitment to accelerating the long-term replacement of the infrastructure, the risks were found to outweigh any benefit by some margin for the community and island businesses.

1. Do Minimum:

This consists of carrying out the minimum works which tackle identified issues and facilitates operations pending delivery of the long-term solution. It excludes a pier extension to accommodate larger vessels. This option comprises the repair of the north berth fenders; linkspan refurbishment; concrete repairs to pier; installation of two new bollards to improve mooring arrangements; replacement of current Passenger Access System (PAS); extension to vehicle marshalling area and local traffic calming measures on A849.

The benefits of this option include minimum investment costs, no major sunken costs, the current level of service can continue to operate from Craignure over the

interim period and prioritises long-term investment which ultimately leads to a solution at Craignure rather than a temporary fix.

The risks identified with this option are that current vehicle capacity issues being experienced on the route would remain and demand management measures may be required, also in order for this option to gain local support, there will need to be a tangible commitment to progress the long-term option.

2. Pier Extension:

As well as the items listed in Option 1, this option would include a pier extension for the overnight berthing of the MV Isle of Mull and day berthing of the MV Hebrides and MV Clansman; replacement of fenders on the north berth; and liaison with RNLi with regards to an alternative or new facility for the RNLi Lifeboat. This option accommodates larger vessel deployment.

The benefits included improved operational arrangements for a wide range of vessels, an improved overnight berth for MV Isle of Mull or MV Isle of Arran would allow an island-based timetable to be adopted year-round and it would also free up an overnight berth in Oban during the winter months, improving overall network resilience.

Further, it would facilitate the introduction of significant additional vehicle deck capacity onto the Oban – Craignure route, addressing peak summer ferry capacity issues.

The risks however are that it would likely postpone the implementation of the long-term solution. Whilst the immediate aspirations of the community would be met, this option risks locking in several of the current issues such as the undersized terminal building, insufficient vehicle marshalling and poorly laid out bus stances.

Conversely, if a long-term measure is pursued within the short term, this would entail significant sunken costs, representing poor value for money.

There also remains a risk of further delay to FMEL 802, which could mean that MV Hebrides and MV Clansman are never deployed to the Craignure route. Also if that deployment does happen several years into the lifespan of this option, its value for money is significantly reduced.

4.6 **Craignure Interim OBC Conclusion**

Results of Interim options concluded that Option 1 (do minimum) should be recommended with the proviso that delivery of the Long-Term solution is expedited. Extension of the existing pier would not be progressed with this option so there is no disruption to the ferry service until at least the Long-Term option is decided on. This option allows funds and timelines to focus on the Long-Term new build solution.

4.7 **Craignure – Public consultation – New Pier (Long Term)**

Consultation is now nearing completion on the Long-Term options for the new infrastructure at Craignure. There are currently four options which incorporate a range potential disruption to current services and choices of layout footprint. A stakeholder working group has been established and further community meetings are planned to maximise the public feedback. Visualisations have been produced by Turner and Townsend with Ramboll UK to aid in these discussions. A verbal update will be provided to Members at the Harbour Board Meeting on the results of these discussions where it is hoped a recommendation on a preferred option can be put to Members.

4.8 Iona / Finnphort Ferry Slips

Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) contract was awarded in March 2021 with a planned completion date of October 2021. The Iona breakwater crest level was reduced in the designs following discussions with CMAL and CalMac. Visualisations have been produced to aid the further consultations with the public.

4.9 Rothesay Harbour Piling and Grouting Works

Tenders were issued as per the previous report to Members however no compliant bids were received. A review of the design and construction methods by AECOM is underway with a view to retender as soon as possible.

4.10 Rothesay pontoons

Initial works on the piling required for the pontoons was stopped due to unexpected deep ground conditions. This has resulted in ongoing discussions with the contractor however to progress the project, Ground Investigation works are being tendered with results expected at the end of August 2021. The results of these works will inform all parties on agreeing a revised program and completion of the original project.

4.11 Dunoon and Kilcreggan

A contract was awarded to Mott MacDonald in January 2021 for the completion of an Outline Business Case (OBC) to consider the feasibility of design solutions which ensure safe berthing and passenger access at Dunoon and Kilcreggan of CMAL's new vessels for the route. Mott MacDonald are also working on a similar contract with CMAL for Gourock. It was intended for the results of this OBC to be available in August 2021 however the process has been put on hold while CMAL decide on general and specific design features of the new vessel / vessels that will be utilised on the triangle route.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 This report provides Members with an update on the major and noteworthy projects and schemes currently being addressed within Argyll and Bute Council Marine Asset Plan.

6.0 IMPLICATIONS

6.1 Policy

None directly arising from this report.

6.2 Financial

There are no proposed increases arising from this report.

6.3 Legal

Considered to be none directly arising from this report.

6.4 HR

None.

6.5 Fairer Scotland Duty:

6.5.1 Equalities - protected characteristics

None directly arising from this report.

6.5.2 Socio-economic Duty

None directly arising from this report.

6.5.3 Islands

Completed works and projects will enhance service reliability.

6.6. Risk

Completed works will reduce the repair and maintenance on existing infrastructure.

6.7 Customer Service

Overall improvement in travel experience and reliability.

Executive Director with responsibility for Roads and Infrastructure:

Kirsty Flanagan

Policy Lead:

Cllr Rory Colville

July 2021

For further information contact:

Scott Reid, Marine Operations Manager Tel: 01546 604 696

Jim Smith, Head of Roads and Infrastructure Services Tel: 01546 604 324

APPENDICES

None